When should new teachers begin to ask critical questions?

Trevor Mutton
University of Oxford

UCET Annual Conference 2019
When should new teachers begin to ask critical questions?

Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

Part 3
What might be the answer?
Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

1. Because it is generally ignored in teacher education policy

2. It enables us to focus on the nature of teacher professionalism

3. It helps us address the relationship between theory and practice
Why is this an important question to ask?

1. Because it is generally ignored in teacher education policy

2. It enables us to focus on the nature of teacher professionalism

3. It helps us address the relationship between theory and practice
Training our next generation of outstanding teachers
Implementation plan
June 2011

Teachers’ Standards

The Importance of Teaching
The Schools White Paper 2010
An improvement strategy for discussion

Carter Review of Initial Teacher Training (ITT)
Sir Andrew Carter OBE
January 2015

Educational Excellence Everywhere
March 2016

ITT Core Content Framework

Early Career Framework
January 2014

Standard for teachers’ professional development
Implementing guidance for school leaders, headteachers, and organizations that offer professional development for teachers

Developing behaviour management content for initial teacher training (ITT)
Tom Bennett, Chair of the ITT Behaviour working group

A framework of core content for initial teacher training (ITT)
July 2016
Programmes should be structured so there is effective integration between the different types of knowledge and skills trainees need to draw on in order to develop their own teaching ...

... trainees have access to the practical wisdom of experts and can engage in a process of enquiry, in an environment where they are able to trial techniques and strategies and evaluate the outcomes. (Carter, 2015, para 2.2.2, pp. 20-21)

We believe that ITT should provide a foundation for on-going development by providing an appropriate combination of access to the expertise of teachers and pupil learning contexts, as well as engagement with and experience of relevant educational research. We believe this supports trainees to become teachers who can reflect on their own teaching, nurturing and reinforcing the idea that teachers are researchers of their own practice who continue to develop throughout their career. (para 2.2.3, pp. 20-21)

Developing close relationships between theory and practice, in a way that helps trainees to understand and explore the links between research and classroom practice, is therefore a crucial element of all ITT programmes. (2015: para 2.2.4, p. 21)

a centralised portal of synthesised executive summaries providing practical advice on research findings about executive teaching should be developed. (2015: Recommendation, p. 54)

Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

1. Because it is generally ignored in teacher education policy

2. It enables us to focus on the nature of teacher professionalism

3. It helps us address the relationship between theory and practice
Efficiency in ‘acquiring and using well-learned schemas and routines’
(Hammerness et al. 2005, p. 374)

Adaptive expertise
The capacity to move beyond existing routines... to rethink key ideas, practices and even values in order to respond to novel situations’
Hammerness et al. 2005, pp. 358-9

Preparing teachers for a Changing World:
What teachers should learn and be able to do

Efficiency in ‘acquiring and using well-learned schemas and routines’

(Hammerness et al. 2005, p. 374)
2 popular conceptions of a good teacher

- Situated understanding *phronesis*
- Technical knowledge *techne*
- Critical reflection *episteme*

Both inadequate as they stand
Only the conception of teacher as professional encompasses all three
Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

1. Because it is generally ignored in teacher education policy

2. It enables us to focus on the nature of teacher professionalism

3. It helps us address the relationship between theory and practice
As teacher training in the UK becomes increasingly school-based, largely as a result of government requirements, the question of whether and in what sense there is a useful place for 'theory' in initial teacher education remains a source of tension and confusion.

(McIntyre, 1995, p.365)

As teacher training in the UK becomes increasingly school-based, largely as a result of government requirements, the question of whether and in what sense there is a useful place for 'theory' in initial teacher education remains a source of tension and confusion.

(McIntyre, 1995, p.365)

Practical theorising means both looking for attractive ideas for practice and subjecting these ideas to critical examination. (Hagger & McIntyre 2006, p.58)

It has to be based too on an acceptance of different perspectives, and especially on a valuing and purposeful use of both the practical, contextualised perspectives of teachers and also the idealised, theoretical and research-based perspectives of university staff. No consensus is to be expected, and student teachers are expected and encouraged to use what they learn in school to critique what they learn in the university and vice versa. It is through this ‘practical theorising’ dialectic that they are expected to develop both their own professional knowledge and the practical theorising or reflective skills and habits which they should continue as teachers to bring to bear both on their own practice and on other suggested ideas.

(McIntyre, 2009, p.605)

It has to be based too on an acceptance of different perspectives, and especially on a valuing and purposeful use of both the practical, contextualised perspectives of teachers and also the idealised, theoretical and research-based perspectives of university staff. No consensus is to be expected, and student teachers are expected and encouraged to use what they learn in school to critique what they learn in the university and vice versa. It is through this ‘practical theorising’ dialectic that they are expected to develop both their own professional knowledge and the practical theorising or reflective skills and habits which they should continue as teachers to bring to bear both on their own practice and on other suggested ideas.

(McIntyre, 2009, p.605)

When should new teachers begin to ask critical questions?

Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

Part 3
What might be the answer?
Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

1. The changing nature of initial teacher education partnerships

2. What are the implications of not asking critical questions?

3. Are there alternatives?
Part 2

What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

1. The changing nature of initial teacher education partnerships

2. What are the implications of not asking critical questions?

3. Are there alternatives?
Waterside Academy: a case-study of two different ITE partnerships operating within an ‘outstanding’ school

The school:
• 11-18 ‘convertor’ academy, with 1700+ pupils on roll
• Consistently above the national average in terms of examination results
• Pupil Premium in line with national average; higher than average students from minority ethnic backgrounds, EAL, and those with special educational needs or disabilities.

The partnerships:
1. A long-established university partnership model
• relatively small secondary PGCE programme (190 in total) across 7 subjects, working with 25-30 schools
• in unbroken partnership with Waterside since its establishment
• teachers from Waterside occasionally seconded to the University

2. A new SCITT-based School Direct programme within a large teaching school alliance
• relatively large primary and secondary programme (60 primary/30 secondary) across a wide range of subjects
• established in 2014 and led by Waterside on behalf of the alliance
• offering ‘salaried’ and ‘tuition-fee’ programmes leading to QTS
• an optional additional PGCE element (in partnership with another university)
Perceived strengths of the SCITT’s SD routes (as reported by Waterside staff working within it)

The management structure
- Easy access (a) of mentors & subject leads to programme leaders;
  (b) of programme leaders to headteachers across the partnership
- Top-down definition of generic programme content; clarity of programme procedures and expectations
- Regular evaluation and rapid revisions in response

The structure of the training programme
- Salaried programme predominantly in one school all year (2nd school - half-day a week)
- Summer training means the associate teachers are in school from start of September

The opportunities offered to associate teachers
- Wide range of expertise distributed across the partnership on which to draw

The way in which theory and practice are integrated
- Lack of separation between ‘central input and school placements’
- Associate teachers can see the school’s implementation of policy and practices rather than dealing with ‘abstract concepts’
- Immediate feedback on ideas that the associate teachers apply
- The immediate emphasis first and foremost on being a professional

The support available for the associate teachers
- Support from colleagues (who know their investment is worth it)

Programme outcomes
- A ‘real sense of autonomy, professional independence and initiative’
You’ve nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.

I don’t actually have anything constructive to tell her other than ‘Brilliant keep it going’.

The massive challenges they will have ... the impact will not [just] be the tiredness and the work. It will be psychological.

There is a lovely layer of pastoral support with multiple counsellors that can intervene and support teachers that are struggling. It’s a very difficult year and helping them get through that – I was pleased and surprised at the depth of pastoral support that was offered from early on.

They can become immersed in practice and in the atmosphere of school, and have time to actually build up their relationships with students in a longer term fashion. I think that that’s extremely helpful to them.
You've nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.

I don't actually have anything constructive to tell her other than ‘Brilliant keep it going’. 

There is a lovely layer of pastoral support with multiple counsellors that can intervene and support teachers that are struggling. It's a very difficult year and helping them get through that – I was pleased and surprised at the depth of pastoral support that was offered from early on.

You've nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.

The massive challenges they will have ... the impact will not [just] be the tiredness and the work. It will be psychological.

They can become immersed in practice and in the atmosphere of school, and have time to actually build up their relationships with students in a longer term fashion. I think that that’s extremely helpful to them.
You've nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.

The massive challenges they will have … the impact will not [just] be the tiredness and the work. It will be psychological.

I don’t actually have anything constructive to tell her other than ‘Brilliant keep it going’.

There is a lovely layer of pastoral support with multiple counsellors that can intervene and support teachers that are struggling. It’s a very difficult year and helping them get through that – I was pleased and surprised at the depth of pastoral support that was offered from early on.

They can become immersed in practice and in the atmosphere of school, and have time to actually build up their relationships with students in a longer term fashion. I think that that’s extremely helpful to them.

You’ve nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.
You've nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.

The massive challenges they will have ... the impact will not [just] be the tiredness and the work. It will be psychological.

I don't actually have anything constructive to tell her other than ‘Brilliant keep it going’.

There is a lovely layer of pastoral support with multiple counsellors that can intervene and support teachers that are struggling. It’s a very difficult year and helping them get through that – I was pleased and surprised at the depth of pastoral support that was offered from early on.

They can become immersed in practice and in the atmosphere of school, and have time to actually build up their relationships with students in a longer term fashion. I think that that’s extremely helpful to them.

You’ve nurtured them and fostered them and they fit into the school which is really, really nice.
Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

1. The changing nature of initial teacher education partnerships

2. What are the implications of not asking critical questions?

3. Are there alternatives?
• understand key educational concepts and the major debates about aims, curriculum and pedagogy that have shaped practice in schools;
• engage with empirical educational research and be capable of assessing its quality and its relevance to their practice;
• think through the ethics of teaching and the challenges of ethical decision-making in the classroom.  (Orchard & Winch 2015, 5).

Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

1. The changing nature of initial teacher education partnerships

2. What are the implications of not asking critical questions?

3. Are there alternatives?
Teachers need to develop both ‘an initial level of teaching competence’ sufficient for them to practise in schools and ‘a capacity for continued professional development’ enabling them to go on learning as a teacher in new contexts’. (Hagger & McIntyre, 2006)

When should new teachers begin to ask critical questions?

Part 1
Why is this an important question to ask?

Part 2
What factors do we need to take account of in addressing the question?

Part 3
What might be the answer?
... the environment of a university is more conducive to the kind of theoretical learning needed by new teachers, which involves sustained discussion and the sharing of ideas away from the immediate pressures of the workplace. (Orchard and Winch, 2015, 27)

UCET Intellectual Basis of Teacher Education

... sets out UCET’s vision for high quality teacher education that values teachers as intellectuals who take an enquiring stance to their work and make meaningful contributions to the professional knowledge base.

... shared intellectual responsibility bringing together complementary forms of knowledge and experience.

... teachers who are:

- competent and confident professionals
- epistemic agents
- able to engage in enquiry-rich practice
- responsible professionals
When should new teachers begin to ask critical questions?
Thank you.